How Transportation Problems Keep People Out of the Workforce in Greater New Haven

A report by the Greater New Haven Job Access and Transportation Working Group

Produced by DataHaven
“Transportation is a civil rights issue, it’s an economic development issue, it’s a jobs issue.”

—Mayor Toni N. Harp, CITY OF NEW HAVEN, JANUARY 2014

“The buses do not run where we are working ... Ultimately, there are a lot of jobs you have to turn down.”

—Participant, RESIDENT FOCUS GROUP, JUNE 2014

ABOUT THIS REPORT

The NAACP’s 2013 State of Minority Affairs Report, Urban Apartheid, called upon residents, organizations, and businesses to "work with planning and zoning boards and the South Central Regional Council of Governments (SCRCOG) to review the impact of inadequate public transportation systems that undermine employment opportunities for too many residents. Our transportation system has not kept pace with the growth of the region and has added to the transportation burden of many families." After NAACP presented these findings to elected officials at SCRCOG, the two organizations formed a partnership in response to the recommendations in Urban Apartheid. In 2014, with additional participation from Workforce Alliance, the newly-created Greater New Haven Job Access and Transportation Working Group partnered with DataHaven, a non-profit public service organization that collects and interprets local information, to facilitate meetings, conduct interviews with area agencies, and study transportation-related barriers to employment. DataHaven also analyzed a survey of New Haven residents conducted by the NAACP, and hired the Connecticut Economic Resource Center (CERC) to conduct a focus group. Mark Abraham, Executive Director of DataHaven, served as the lead author of this report, which would not have been possible without contributions from Carl Amento (SCRCOG), Jim Rawlings, Howard Hill, and James Rawlins (NAACP – Greater New Haven Branch), Bill Villano and Mike Krauss (Workforce Alliance), Carmel Ford (CERC), and others, as well as funding from SCRCOG.

When you can’t find or afford transportation to a job interview, job training or place of work, you give up after a while. This cycle is hard to break, and frequently moves from one generation to the next, creating a downward spiral of long-term unemployment, poverty and despair.

**THE BIG PICTURE** of economic opportunity in Greater New Haven reflects these issues. Most low-income adults live in urban neighborhoods where housing is affordable. Although downtown New Haven remains an important hub for work, most entry- and mid-level jobs are now located outside of the city. This is called “job sprawl.” Entry-level jobs that individuals can walk to are scarce. Jobs where a worker can take a bus to get to work are also harder to find than they were a generation ago.

Even after someone has found work on a bus route, they may be assigned to a night or weekend shift when bus service is not available. Taking it one step further, even when bus service is available, a delayed bus may keep them from making the transfer to another bus that will get them to work.

Moving out to suburban areas where the jobs are is rarely an option. In these neighborhoods, housing prices, availability of child care, and access to critical community services are no longer within reach.

Looking at transportation in the City of New Haven, more than one out of every four households and families (13,000) are “zero car” households, with no car available. In the Dixwell, Dwight, Hill, and West Rock neighborhoods, nearly half of households have no car. In the inner suburbs of East Haven, Hamden, and West Haven, an additional one out of every ten households (5,000) has no car. The number of “low car” households—those with less than one car per worker—is even larger. Considering the cost of purchase, upkeep, gas, and parking, the prospect of car ownership fades quickly for many families.

Participants in Connecticut’s largest job placement programs consistently identify transportation as the most common barrier to finding and maintaining a job. For example, 84% of CTWorks registrants identify transportation as a barrier to work, versus 60% who identify child care, 23% who identify a lack of education, and 11% who identify a lack of job experience. Advocates and agency workers sometimes help clients solve their personal transportation problems one individual at a time. But with levels of long-term unemployment still at a record high, the ineffectiveness of this piecemeal, time-consuming approach is discouraging to all.

The continuing cycle of limited economic opportunity due to transportation difficulty can be addressed. This has been demonstrated in cities and communities where coordinated planning and policy-making have focused on improving job access. For example, faster and more frequent buses into downtown areas can encourage higher wage workers to use public transportation and leave their cars at home. The money saved can then be used to improve bus service to suburban jobs.

Putting transportation equity as a high priority in planning and policy-making, especially when economic stimulus dollars and tax incentives are involved, can go a long way in fixing a system that leaves the poor and unemployed unable to move forward.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

• The findings of this report reflect new research demonstrating that the spread of jobs to suburban areas with limited public transportation has been a direct cause of long-term unemployment, particularly in communities with lower household income and fewer cars available.4

• Across the unemployed population in Connecticut, transportation is by far the most commonly-reported barrier to getting a job. A variety of workforce agencies interviewed for this report agreed that transportation investments would increase job access for the communities they serve.

• Residents of Greater New Haven are now significantly more likely to identify job opportunities located outside the city or town where they live than within it. But for many, the high cost of owning a car greatly limits access to these jobs. In surveys and focus groups, residents identified inadequate bus service on weekends and evenings, and infrequent or late service in general, as issues that greatly reduce their ability to find and maintain good jobs. This sentiment is backed up by data analysis that reveals the lack of evening and weekend bus service to job locations.

• The vast majority of entry- and mid-level jobs in Greater New Haven are now found in suburban towns. Affluent “outer ring” suburbs have tens of thousands of lower-wage employment opportunities, but also have limited bus service and a shortage of housing that might be affordable for lower-wage workers. The economies of these towns are dependent upon commuters from the more economically-diverse and affordable parts of our region: there are 61,000 jobs paying less than a living wage located within the 10 “outer ring” towns, but only 47,000 workers earning less than a living wage who live in those towns. This “spatial mismatch” of jobs and workers is particularly pronounced among workers of color.7

• The Greater New Haven Job Access and Transportation Working Group is now taking steps to advocate for improved transportation service, increase regional planning and coordination, address the other issues identified within this report, and take steps to explore innovative solutions to help minimize these barriers (see page 12).
“Unemployment, particularly the persistent high levels of youth unemployment, is a public health time bomb waiting to explode.”

—Dr. Michael Marmot, INSTITUTE OF HEALTH EQUITY

Rates of long-term joblessness in Greater New Haven remain at or near historic highs, particularly among youth, and nearly one out of every four workers reports being unemployed or underemployed (Figure 1). Scarcity of work on such a large scale has an adverse impact on the physical and mental health of neighbors, families, and entire communities, though some are impacted more than others. For example, within the City of New Haven, workers living in affluent neighborhoods such as Westville and East Rock are seven times less likely to be unemployed than workers in neighborhoods that have less affluent households such as Fair Haven, Newhallville, and the Hill.
As suburban areas have grown in recent decades, the distances that a typical resident must travel to get to work have dramatically increased, and residents now find their employment opportunities much more limited by geography and access to transportation. The scattering of jobs across a larger area is known as “job sprawl,” and is now considered to be a direct cause of high levels of long-term unemployment, particularly within urban communities. Within the City of New Haven, the impact of “job sprawl” appears to vary at a neighborhood level (Figure 2). Between 1980 and 2012, the percent of workers living in Fair Haven, Newhallville, and the Hill who work outside of New Haven nearly doubled, while in the more affluent communities of East Rock, East Shore, and Westville, the shift was marginal.

“"How can we promote public transportation, when they are building so many parking lots and garages downtown?"”

Some cities have attempted to reverse “job sprawl”—and thereby reduce unemployment—by coordinating incentives for economic development, for example, by providing subsidies to businesses, worker-owned coops, and residential developers that invest in areas near a high-frequency bus line or train station. While the state of Connecticut has created programs that encourage the hiring of unemployed residents, such as STEP UP, these programs are not as targeted toward areas with existing transportation as they could be. A review of over 500 recent STEP UP program placements in Greater New Haven found that over half of the jobs being subsidized in the Greater New Haven area are physically located in suburban towns. Workers without access to a car can find it impossible to access some of these jobs, especially if they involve night or weekend shifts.

*2012 is the most recent year for which comprehensive, locally-specific data on joblessness and underemployment are available.

---

**Participant, NAACP Job Access Meeting, June 2014**
MISSING THE LAST BUS

About three-quarters of residents of Greater New Haven live within walking distance of a rush hour bus stop. However, because transfers are often required to travel across this area, a typical resident of Greater New Haven can use public transit to reach only 27 percent of jobs in the region within a 90 minute one-way commute taken at rush hour. Transit users living within the City of New Haven are closer to transfer points, and therefore, are able to reach about 44 percent of all jobs in the region within 90 minutes using rush-hour bus service. But this still means that more than half of jobs are difficult or impossible to access by city residents without a private car, which greatly limits their employment opportunities.

Given that many businesses operate on nights and weekends, DataHaven conducted an additional analysis by combining statewide data on job locations with maps and time schedules of all bus routes in Greater New Haven. This analysis confirmed that access is limited in many areas (Figure 3).

**FIG. 3** Job Access by Time of Day and Industry

**BY TIME OF DAY:**

- During the morning rush hour (7-9am) 69% of all jobs in Greater New Haven are physically located within a quarter-mile of at least one active bus stop.

- But in late evenings (10pm-12am) and on Sunday mornings (7-9am) only 42% of jobs are located near an active bus stop.

**BY INDUSTRY:**

- Retail and restaurant jobs, which are crucial sources of employment, are even less likely to be located near active bus stops late at night. For workers who seek opportunities in retail, roughly two-thirds of jobs in our 15-town region may be inaccessible by public transit during weekday evenings.

Further analysis will be needed to develop an understanding of specific gaps in the public transportation system. Job access mapping suggests that there are many clusters of job locations throughout outer suburbs that are impossible to access by bus on nights and weekends.
According to the American Automobile Association, the cost to own and operate a very modest car is $7,000 per year.

Many households in Greater New Haven find this to be an excessive cost.

10 percent of workers who say they often have a car available are unemployed, whereas the unemployment rate among workers who say they do not often have access to a car is 35 percent.

Leaders of workforce agencies interviewed for this report noted that unemployed residents, persons with disabilities, and persons returning from prison were unlikely to have access to a private car—including when they needed one to access jobs or job interviews. Many of these agencies have stories about placing their clients into jobs, only to see them struggle because their car breaks down or they have unreliable transportation. Workforce agencies also noted that large amounts of accumulated fines can discourage unemployed workers or workers with limited savings from trying to obtain a vehicle.

Furthermore, minorities, young adults, and lower-income residents are several times less likely to possess a driver’s license to begin with. This issue also surfaced repeatedly in interviews with agency leaders, particularly those that work with young adults.

Following decades of major changes in urban development patterns and in society as a whole, limited public transportation routes combined with the lack of car ownership means that many residents find it difficult to access job opportunities in Greater New Haven.

WHEELS TO WORK

Not surprisingly, the lack of a car is strongly associated with unemployment in Greater New Haven:

- 10% Unemployment Rate
- 35% Unemployment Rate

Among all Greater New Haven families with children, only 77% of those who earn less than $50,000 per year say that they often have access to a car, while 98% of those earning over that amount say that they do.
Additional Data

**NAACP 2014 SURVEY OF LOW-INCOME RESIDENTS**

From June through August 2014, the Greater New Haven NAACP worked with city agencies and community groups to distribute a paper-based survey on job access. NAACP collected 262 survey responses from residents of the City of New Haven, primarily from among residents with limited incomes. NAACP also organized a public meeting on the issue of job access in June 2014. To provide context to the NAACP’s targeted sample of community members, some questions were benchmarked against results from the broader DataHaven Wellbeing Survey, which interviewed a representative sample of 1,307 randomly-selected Greater New Haven area residents by cell phone and landline in Fall 2012.

### UNEMPLOYMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NAACP SURVEY RESPONDENTS IN THE CITY OF NEW HAVEN (n=262)</th>
<th>ALL GREATER NEW HAVEN REGION RESIDENTS (2012) (n=1,307)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percent of workers who report being unemployed</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CAR ACCESS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NAACP SURVEY RESPONDENTS WHO WERE UNEMPLOYED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percent of respondents who say they do not often have access to a car when they need it</td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### COMMUTING

**Q:** How do you usually get to your job or to any job interviews? (n=230)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NAACP SURVEY RESPONDENTS</th>
<th>NAACP SURVEY RESPONDENTS WHO WERE UNEMPLOYED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public transportation</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drive alone</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bike or walk</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carpool or Taxi</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Most common reasons given why you cannot often use public transportation to access job opportunities (multiple choice, among those looking for a job, n=207):**

- **35%** Bus routes don’t go to the places I need them to go.
- **22%** Buses don’t operate when needed (late night, early, weekends).
- **16%** The distance is too far or the bus takes too long to get there.
- **12%** The bus is expensive.
- **9%** I need a car to do other errands during the day or after work.
- **9%** My job requires me to use a car.
- **7%** I cannot easily get to a bus stop.
- **6%** I have concerns about personal safety.
In June 2014, CERC and Workforce Alliance facilitated a focus group of 22 area residents to gather information on access to jobs using the public transportation system in the Greater New Haven Region as well as the system’s overall service quality. Some attendees expressed that they had difficulty commuting to job locations, had to turn down jobs because they considered the commute to be too long, or had felt unsafe or uncomfortable walking home because of a lack of service availability. Further, many said that there is an issue with cleanliness on the buses, and that during certain times of day, there is an issue with overcrowding. Others explained that they often resort to other modes of transportation to commute, such as carpooling with coworkers, obtaining rides from families and friends, and utilizing bicycles—modes which are sometimes not dependable enough to maintain jobs.

When asked which factor is the most important in finding a job: skills, overall growth in jobs, or transportation to jobs; transportation was ranked as the most critical factor. Attendees believed that employers will provide specific skill training, but job access is critical.

Attendees recommended ways to improve the system, such as extending service availability in the evenings and on weekends, and using express buses to transport individuals to and from other employment hubs in Connecticut, such as Waterbury and Bridgeport. Universal transfers between transit districts were suggested. It was also suggested that small vans or shuttles replace buses that serve few users; and that larger buses should replace regular-sized, overcrowded buses, especially during peak hours. Attendees also expressed that there should be increased communication among bus drivers so that users do not miss their transfers when buses are running slightly behind schedule. Technology should be used to facilitate communications between drivers and to let riders know the location and status of buses they are waiting for, according to participants.
Endnotes


6 “Outer ring” towns in this case include Woodbridge, Orange, Bethany, North Haven, Branford, North Branford, Milford, Madison, Guilford, and Cheshire.

7 The mismatch of jobs and workers is even more pronounced among workers who identify as black or Hispanic: There are 21,000 minority workers who have jobs located in the outer ring, but only 6,000 minority workers (4,000 of whom earn less than $20/hour) who live in these towns. In other words, for every four minority workers earning less than $20/hour who work in the outer ring suburban towns, there is only one minority worker earning less than $20/hour who lives there. These disparities are not seen by education level, income, or job type, indicating that the legacy of barriers historically faced by minorities in the United States—such as discrimination and lower levels of inherited wealth—continue to exist and are important to understand and address today.

8 DataHaven and Siena College Research Institute. (2012). Greater New Haven Wellbeing Survey. New Haven, CT: DataHaven. Data are for the 13-town region surveyed. In the Greater New Haven Region, an estimated 69% of all adults are either currently working in a paid job or not working but say they would like to work (the remaining 31% of adults are retired, full-time students, or otherwise not interested in working in a paid job). Of these 69%, an estimated 22% are either not working but say they would like to work (unemployed), or are working part-time even though they say they would prefer to have full-time work (under-employed). This measure is higher than official government definitions of the unemployment rate, which only consider those who are not working in any job at all and are actively seeking employment. The Wellbeing Survey also measured long-term unemployment, and found similar disparities by education level, race, and ethnicity.


12 Stoll, M. (2005). Job Sprawl and the Spatial Mismatch between Blacks and Jobs. Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Metropolitan Policy Program. According to the analysis, in the Greater New Haven area, 55 percent of black workers or 55 percent of all jobs would need to relocate in order to completely eliminate the geographic imbalance, or spatial mismatch, that is caused by the growth of jobs in outer suburban areas. Levels of spatial mismatch between non-minority workers and jobs are much lower.

13 The geography of joblessness: The difficulty people have in getting to jobs makes unemployment unnecessarily high. (2014, October 25). The Economist.


19 DataHaven GIS analysis of 2011 Census LEHD data by NAICS code and Greater New Haven transit 2014 GTFS data. To create these estimates, we created a lower and upper limit of the number of jobs that might possibly be located within a quarter-mile of the exact location of every active bus stop, and then took the midpoint of that range. This accounts for the fact that the method is somewhat imprecise, as job locations are only available at a block-by-block level, not as actual addresses to which exact distances on foot can be calculated. Given the lack of sidewalks, crosswalks, and other barriers to walking that are frequently found in our cities and towns, if anything, the figures here should be considered overestimates of the proportion of jobs that can easily be accessed using the bus system. Nevertheless, they are important to compare across time periods to show how bus service may differ between rush hour and weekend routes.

20 It is important to note that even in cases where buses run close to a worker’s house and place of work, the time needed to transfer between different bus lines may be significant.

21 Song, Deanna. (2014).

22 DataHaven and Siena College Research Institute. (2012).


24 National Household Travel Survey. (2009). Nationally, the percent of U.S. adults with no driver’s license is 11%. However, the rate is 7% among those who identify as white, 21% among those who identify as black or African-American, and 21% among those who identify as Hispanic or Latino. Data are for all persons age 16 or older.
Working Together to Improve Job Access in Greater New Haven

This report is a first step toward mobilizing additional individuals, community groups, and government to create a more equitable and economically competitive region. The Greater New Haven Job Access and Transportation Working Group identified the following actions needed to address the crisis of long-term joblessness and promote social justice in Greater New Haven:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area of need</th>
<th>What members of the Working Group are doing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EXPANDED AND IMPROVED TRANSPORTATION SERVICES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. The Working Group acknowledges that an innovative and collaborative strategy is required - one that pools community, private, and public resources together to promote economic opportunity in communities with the greatest transportation access needs. The Working Group will continue to meet regularly and investigate how services can be better aligned to where jobs are and where people live. SCRCOG is committed to funding further work to implement solutions to these important issues.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Going forward, the NAACP is developing an action plan to solicit additional input from the community to explore new options for meeting its transportation needs; investigate how non-profit and for-profit organizations within Greater New Haven, especially church organizations, can leverage their array of vehicles to help minimize transportation as a barrier to employment; and engage livery and taxi services to be a part of a new commercial venture.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Following legislation passed by the Connecticut General Assembly, the Connecticut Department of Transportation is reviewing public policies related to “for hire” and ridesharing services, such as Uber and Lyft. The Working Group will monitor this issue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. CT Transit reviews bus routes throughout the year in response to public comments and changing ridership. Next year, CT Transit will meet with the Working Group to improve the survey tools that it uses to assess service quality. Also, CT Transit will install real-time GPS tracking and other new data systems that can be used to improve service.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. The City of New Haven, in conjunction with the Greater New Haven Transit District, is beginning a major federally-funded design study to improve the quality and frequency of transportation service, particularly within neighborhoods with high unemployment rates. The study will look at coordinating existing transportation resources, such as employer shuttles.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT POLICIES THAT PRIORITIZE EQUITY AND JOB ACCESS, NOT ONLY JOB CREATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. The Working Group will educate policymakers, city planners, elected officials, and residents about the importance of this issue through the distribution of this report to key stakeholders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. The Working Group will ask that transportation officials and advocates be represented within Greater New Haven’s economic development strategy and policy meetings, to help ensure that job access and transportation barriers are considered when major decisions are made.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. The Working Group will engage state government to obtain increased investment in transportation service and transit-oriented development. It will request that state incentives currently provided to businesses to promote job creation in Connecticut be more specifically targeted to areas that are easily accessed by public transportation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>REMOVAL OF OTHER BARRIERS TO JOB ACCESS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. The Working Group will increase its communication about services that are available to workers who are looking for jobs and/or transportation services (e.g., CT Rides), and will work to ensure that funding for these programs is maintained.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. The Working Group will contact the State Legislature and Department of Motor Vehicles to ask them to investigate the fees and fines that currently prevent some low-income and/or otherwise marginalized residents from accessing a private vehicle.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If you have suggestions on how to address the critical community issues raised in this report, please contact the individual organizations represented within the Greater New Haven Job Access and Transportation Working Group. Specific questions or comments about this report may be sent to DataHaven, 129 Church Street, New Haven, CT, or via email at info@ctdatahaven.org.